



**LANSING BOARD OF WATER AND LIGHT  
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS**

**SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES  
December 21, 2021**

The Board of Commissioners met at the BWL Headquarters-REO Town Depot located at 1201 S. Washington Ave., Lansing, MI, at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, December 21, 2021.

Chairperson David Price called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

The Acting Corporate Secretary called the roll.

Present: Commissioners David Price, Dusty Horwitt, Semone James, DeShon Leek, Tracy Thomas, and Sandra Zerkle. Non-Voting Commissioners present: Larry Merrill (Delta Township), and Brian Ross (DeWitt Township).

Absent: Commissioners Beth Graham and Tony Mullen and Non-Voting Commissioner Douglas Jester (East Lansing)

The Acting Corporate Secretary declared a quorum.

Chair Price led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

**MEETING PURPOSE:**

**Approval of RFP Selected HR Hiring Consultant**

Chair Price stated that he called for this Special meeting to consider the approval of RFP Selected HR Hiring Consultant and would like to put forward a Resolution.

Chair Price turned the floor over to Michael Flowers, Interim Executive Director of Human Resources. Mr. Flowers requested Board approval of the resolution for the Approval of RFP Selected HR Hiring Consultant and opened the floor for discussion.

A discussion followed in which the Commissioners asked for clarification of the pricing systems for the three companies and whether the hiring fees were for each employee position. Mr. Flowers provided the hiring fees, approval cost and additional expenses that each company proposed and a comparison of the value of each proposal.

Commissioner Zerkle asked for clarification of the pricing system for the three companies that are being considered as the HR Hiring Consultant. Mr. Flowers provided the hiring fees, approval cost and additional expenses that each company proposed and a comparison of the value of each proposal.

Commissioner James asked if the hiring fees proposed were for each employee position and Mr. Flowers affirmed.

Commissioner Thomas asked for further clarification on the pricing of the three companies that submitted RFP's and Mr. Flowers responded.

Commissioner Leek asked, as a piggy-back to Commissioner Thomas' request, as the new Commissioners don't have the information from previous services provided, if the reason that the proposal from Pinnacle Professional Services was so thin compared to the other two proposals was because Pinnacle was already retained with the BWL, and the other proposals go into depth, and they get nothing from Pinnacle. Mr. Flowers responded that Pinnacle provided one page of bulleted items and didn't expand upon anything like the other proposals did. Commissioner Thomas stated that based on Commissioner Leek's question and Mr. Flower's response quote, "that was the only information that Pinnacle provided", he would be voting no to Pinnacle.

Commissioner Horwitt asked for a ball-park amount of any additional costs that were mentioned in one of the proposals and the comfort level for negotiating a reduced fee. Mr. Flowers responded that the costs would range from \$500 to \$1,600 and he has previously negotiated fees. Commissioner Horwitt also asked if Mr. Flowers had any experience working with any of the companies as Mr. Flowers had recommended Pinnacle. Mr. Flowers responded that he has worked briefly with Pinnacle and extensively with Global and both have worked very well, but he has not worked with Blue Chip previously.

Chair Price asked how many applicants there were for the Corporate Secretary position currently and Mr. Flowers said that there were at least 25.

**Motion** by Commissioner Zerkle, Seconded by Commissioner James, to eliminate Pinnacle Professional Services from the selection process for the HR Hiring Consultant.

**Discussion:** Commissioner Zerkle stated that due to the limited information provided by Pinnacle Professional Services that they be not considered and be removed from the hiring consultant selection process. Commissioner James commented that Pinnacle Professional Services was not independent of the Board of Water and Light and should not be considered.

**Action:** Carried Unanimously.

Commissioner Thomas requested further discussion on the two remaining companies as Pinnacle Professional Services was the one that was recommended and was talked about because the information provided was limited. He appreciated Blue Chip sharing what they

shared, that they were diverse, had a female in charge, and hired 425 people in one year. He added that he was equally impressed with Global Business Resources Group, with their independence and hitting and reaching out to different and diverse sites. Global provided extensive information on their qualifications, references and how they would conduct an applicant search. He added that Global was local. Commissioner Horwitt added that he was also impressed with Global Business Resources Group for the same reasons.

**RESOLUTION #2021-12-02**  
**Approval of RFP Selected HR Hiring Consultant**

WHEREAS, Chapter 2, Section 5-202 of the Lansing City Charter requires the Board of Commissioners to appoint a Director, Internal Auditor and Corporate Secretary.

WHEREAS, Section 19.6 of the Board of Water & Light's ("BWL") Administrative Rules of Procedure states:

The Board of Commissioners may hire external consultants, such as accountants, but not outside legal counsel. The full Board will meet before a consultant is hired to determine the scope of the issues to be addressed by the consultant, the consultant's budget, and the scope of contact with the Board. One Board member may be authorized as the primary contact with the consultant.

WHEREAS, at the regular Board meeting on November 16, 2021, the Board of Commissioners approved a Resolution 2021-11-03 to retain a hiring consultant to assist with filling vacancies in the positions of Internal Auditor and Corporate Secretary.

WHEREAS, Resolution 2021-11-03 directed the Executive Director of Human Resources to issue a Request for Proposal for the sole purpose of obtaining proposals for recruiting hiring consultants and for the Board of Commissioners to then choose and retain the consultant.

WHEREAS, BWL staff engaged in its normal public procurement process for the purpose of soliciting and evaluating proposals from a variety of independent recruiting firms and received three qualifying proposals.

RESOLVED, having reviewed the proposals received and considered the recommendations of the Chair, the Vice Chair and the Executive Director of Human Resources, the Board of Commissioners hereby selects Global Business Resource Group as the hiring consultant to assist the Board with the recruitment and hiring of a new Internal Auditor and Corporate Secretary; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, the Chair of the Board of Commissioners shall execute any agreements necessary to effectuate the selection of said hiring consultant.

**Motion** by Commissioner Price, **Seconded** by Commissioner Zerkle to approve the Resolution for the RFP Selected HR Hiring Consultant.

**Action:** Carried Unanimously.

Further discussion followed on the hiring process and the three qualified candidates previously interviewed the Internal Auditor position.

Commissioner Zerkle requested a discussion on how the hiring process would proceed with the hiring consultant and the time frame for the search. Mr. Flowers responded that Global Business Resources Group would be retained, and a plan of action would be made with the HR Committee. Mr. Flowers stated that with the pool of candidates already received interviews could begin within six to eight weeks.

Commissioner Thomas asked if the three candidates for the Internal Auditor position that have already been interviewed that were provided by Pinnacle Professional Services would be included in the Global Business Resources Group Process. Commissioner Thomas said that Global Business Resources Group would probably have different interview questions for their applicants, in addition the HR Committee has a new Commissioner, Commissioner Horwitt.

Mr. Flowers responded that the three candidates would still be considered for the position if they were still available.

Commissioner Zerkle asked if the three candidates would be re-interviewed. Mr. Flowers responded that the three candidates may need to be re-interviewed for a fresh comparison for the best qualified candidate and it would be the choice of the Commission to reinterview.

Commissioner James asked to whom the hiring consultant would report. Chair Price responded that he is the contact person as the Chair of the HR Committee, but the process is run by the entire HR Committee. Commissioner James requested that Resolution #2021-11-03 be amended to add a second contact in addition to the Chairperson to whom the Hiring Consultant would report. Commissioner Thomas asked Commissioner James to consider the follow friendly amendment, that Resolution #2012-11-03 be amended to state that the Hiring Consultant report directly to the entire Human Resources Committee. That friendly amendment was accepted.

**Motion** by Commissioner Zerkle, **Seconded** by Commissioner James, to amend Resolution #2021-11-03, Retain a Hiring Consultant, to strike from the resolution “with the Chairperson as the primary contact”.

**Action:** Carried Unanimously (Yeas: Commissioners David Price, Dusty Horwitt, Semone James, DeShon Leek, Tracy Thomas, and Sandra Zerkle; Nays: None)

The resolution will read as follows:

**RESOLVED**, the Board of Commissioners will require the Consultant to report directly to the Human Resources Committee.

Commissioner Thomas requested verification from Mr. Flowers, that information from the Hiring Consultant would be sent to all four of the HR Committee members, at the same time. Mr. Flowers affirmed.

Commissioner Horwitt requested that whether the candidate has exercised independence previously on the job be included as an interview question. Chair Price responded that discussion is held with the hiring consultant on the direction Commissioners would like to go and to set timelines for interviewing.

Commissioner Ross asked that since another search firm was hired for the three previous Internal Auditor candidates, if a candidate was selected from the first search firm would two fees need to be paid. Mr. Flowers responded that the recruiter from which a candidate has been selected is entitled to a fee and the consultant that was hired by resolution would be entitled to a fee for services provided if the candidate was not selected through them. Commissioner James asked about the contractual relations with Pinnacle Professional Services. Mr. Flowers responded that the contract was with the Board of Water and Light and not with the Board of Commissioners.

#### **MANAGER'S REMARKS/COMMENTS**

There were no Manager's remarks.

#### **COMMISSIONERS' REMARKS/COMMENTS**

Commissioner Thomas thanked Mr. Flowers for all his work.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no public comments.

#### **EXCUSED ABSENCE**

Motion by Commissioner Zerkle, Seconded by Commissioner Leek to excuse Commissioners Beth Graham, Douglas Jester, and Tony Mullen from tonight's meeting.

**Action:** Motion Carried.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Price adjourned the meeting at 6:18 p.m.