AGENDA

HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE MEETING

March 17, 2015 5:30 P.M. – 1201 S. Washington Ave. REO Town Depot

Call to Order

Roll Call

Public Comments on Agenda Items

1. Human Resources Committee Meeting Minutes of January 20, 2015......TAB 1

2. General Manager Search/Timeline

3. Annual Appointments/long-term contracts/severance payments

5. Corporate Secretary Performance Evaluation

Other

Adjourn

HUMAN RESOURCE COMMITTEE January 20, 2015

The Human Resource Committee Chairperson Cynthia Ward called the meeting to order and asked the Secretary to call the roll. The following members were present: Commissioners Cynthia Ward, Anthony McCloud, Tony Mullen and David Price. Also present: Commissioners Margaret Bossenbery, Dennis Louney, Tracy Thomas and Sandra Zerkle.

Absent: None

Public Comments

There were no public comments

Human Resources (HR) Committee Chair Ward thanked all of the Commissioners who are not part of the HR Committee for attending this evening and welcomed Interim General Manager Dick Peffley to this meeting. As the Chair of the HR Committee Commissioner Ward took privilege to move Agenda item #2(Draft Contract for Interim General Manager) down on the Agenda to become item #4. There is a legal memo associated with mentioned item therefore the Committee will go into Closed Session pursuant to Michigan Law as well as go into a separate Closed Session for Agenda item #5.

Approval of Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Mullen, seconded by Commissioner Price to approve the Human Resource Committee meeting minutes of September 16, 2014.

Action: Motion Carried

Resolution Designating Commissioners to work with Legal Counsel

HR Chair Ward stated there was a Resolution put forth last week at the Special Board Meeting that included designees for working with legal counsel pertaining to the termination of J. Peter Lark. The purpose of this Resolution is to clarify that it is the Board Chair and the HR Chair to serve as the point persons to resolve or work with legal counsel to resolve any disputes or to finalize the termination of J. Peter Lark. This resolution clarifies that language; this resolution also makes it clear that any final discussion or terms relative to finalizing the termination of J. Peter Lark is to be presented to the Full Board for consideration and for a vote.

At the request of Commissioner McCloud, HR Chair Ward read the following Resolution into the record.

Proposed Resolution

BE IT RESOLVED, That the official point of contact for the purpose of working with legal counsel to finalize the termination of J. Peter Lark's contract will be Chair David Price and Human Resources Chair Cynthia Ward; and

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, That the full Board of Commissioners will be kept appropriately updated by Commissioners Ward and Price of developments; and any proposals for final resolution will be presented to the full Board of Commissioners for consideration and approval.

Motion by Commissioner Price, Seconded by Commissioner McCloud to forward the proposed Resolution to the Full Board for consideration.

Action: Motion Carried

Sample Performance Evaluation Forms

HR Chair Ward stated that at a prior Human Resources committee meeting there was some discussion about making changes to the instrument that is used to evaluate the Board's three appointed employees. Ms. Ward stated that she contacted the American Public Power Association (APPA) and they shared several evaluation samples. She said the evaluations included in the meeting packet is primarily for information and welcomes any thoughts on the documents. Chair Ward stated that she is partial to the APPA evaluation form because the areas that they tend to address would be appropriate in the areas that this Board would want to address in our evaluation form. She said that the samples included is just for the General Manager and is still trying to secure sample evaluations for the Internal Auditor and the Corporate Secretary.

Chair Price said the sample is nice and is in favor of it. It narrows down the choices and the scale is much more reflective of what is being used in many personnel evaluations today. He said that we need different evaluations for our different employees because the questions that need to be asked are significantly different for each of the appointed employees.

HR Chair Ward said that she would like to include on the appointed employee's evaluation forms an area that explicitly indicates goals and objectives going forward in the next year. She stated that she would follow up with the APPA to see if their form can be used due to their copyright status.

Commissioner Mullen said that he would like to have an opportunity to sign the evaluation forms. HR Chair Ward stated that the Board needs to think about whether it makes since to put forth eight separate evaluations or one Board evaluation. After more discussion regarding this matter, HR Chair Ward stated that she will make sure that Commissioner Mullen's concerns are addressed.

Draft Contract for Interim General Manager

HR Chair Ward stated that the Committee is being provided with an Attorney Client Privileged Memorandum. Considering such a discussion is most appropriate in Closed Session.

Motion by Commissioner Mullen, Seconded by Commissioner McCloud to go into closed session for the purpose of reviewing the contents of the attorney-client privileged memorandum as permitted by the Open Meetings Act, specifically MCL 15.268(h) and MCL 15.243(g).

Roll Call Vote: Yeas: Commissioners Ward, McCloud, Mullen and Price Nays: None

The Human Resource Committee meeting went into closed session at 5:14 p.m.

Motion by Commissioner Price, seconded by Commissioner McCloud that the Human Resource Committee returned to open session. (6:25 p.m.)

HR Chair requested Members of the HR Committee, All Board of Commissioners and the Board's Attorneys to be include in the Closed Session.

Upon conclusion of the closed sessions, the following motion was made.

Motion by Commissioner McCloud, Seconded by Commissioner Mullen to allowing HR Chair Ward and Board Chair Price to work with the attorneys and Mr. Peffley in finalizing the terms of his contract and said contract to be brought back to the Full Board for review and approval.

Action: Motion Carried

<u>Closed Session Discussion (Attorney-Client Memo)</u>...... (DISCUSSION ONLY) [MCL 15.268(h) and MCL 15.243(g)]

Motion by Commissioner Price, Seconded by Commissioner McCloud to go into Closed Session for the purpose of reviewing the contents of the Attorney-Client Privileged Memorandum as permitted by the Open Meetings Act, specifically MCL 15.268(h) and MCL 15.243(g).

Roll Call Vote: Yeas: Commissioners Ward, McCloud, Mullen and Price Nays: None

The Human Resource Committee meeting went into closed session at 6:29 p.m.

Motion by Commissioner McCloud, seconded by Commissioner Price that the Human Resource Committee returned to open session. (7:40 p.m.)

Other

None

Excused Absence

None

Public Comments

None

<u>Adjourn</u>

On Motion by Commissioner Price, seconded by Commissioner McCloud, the meeting adjourned at 7:41 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted Cynthia Ward, Chair Human Resource Committee

form

						Performance Evaluation- General Manager	
n an		2223-031-4-22929w		1	>	2.4.FT	Managaran Lordan Januar (1990) San Januar Angel San Januar Angel San Januar Angel San Januar Angel San Januar Angel San Januar
						aluation- General	Manage
* Required							
Name *							
		ngo gangangan kalangan ka	ndh na i i i i i i i i i				
Has the General	1	2	3	4	5	ully managed the organization finan	cially?*
Has the General	1	2	3	4	5		cially? *
Has the General seldom or not at all	1 D I ma gets	2 © Inaç	3 © Jer (wei	4 © go b l? *	5 ©		-
Has the General seldom or not at all Does the Genera	1 D I ma gets	2 © Inaç	3 © Jer (wei	4 © go b	5 ©	all of the time	-

Does the General Manager build a strong staff to support the organization's efforts? *

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🛞 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager perform competently regarding quality/quantity of work, planning/organizing, decision making, communication, public relations, interpersonal relations with co-workers, and supervision?*

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🛞 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager promote a good working relationship with the Board of Commissioners?*

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

DRAFT

Accountability/Communications

Does the General Manager communicate openly and effectively with commissioners?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager provide useful information to the board that is helpful in board decision making?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager openly respect and trust the board?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🛞 🛞 🛞 🛞 all of the time

Does the General Manager meet commitments made to the board?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manger demonstrate skills of conflict mangement?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all <a> <a>

Other comments

						Performance Evaluation- General Manager	
Executive l	_ea	ad	er	sh	ip		DRAFT
Does the General	Ma	inag	jer (leve	elop	and promote a clear vision for t	he organization?
	Ţ	2	3	4	5		
seldom or not at all	0	0	¢	0	0	all of the time	
Does the General	l Ma	inag	jer l	nire	and	develop quality and diverse sta	aff?
	1	2	3	4	5		
seldom or not at all	۲	0	٢	0	\bigcirc	all of the time	
- 11 - 20 - 11 - 71 - 75 - 76 - 76 - 76 - 76 - 76 - 76 - 76	etuano menedicio	artere dadaret ve	istericit etc.etc	2535 N 10 M 0PS/	ant conversion	-100-44-63100-02000(4100)0-6-44-6-12-10-4-20-4-631	
	etuano menedicio	artere dadaret ve		2535 N 10 M 0PS/	ant conversion	-100-44-63100-02000(4100)0-6-44-6-12-10-4-20-4-631	
seldom or not at all	0	9					
seldom or not at all			Chicking (marganet)	استحار مردسيا الا	in pà chuilteach		1
seldom or not at all			سرية الإستانية المعالم معالم الم	ndorf an crimpi Hi	ing a constraints		
seldom or not at all			n si falla para ana d		an a		
				nation (an a còmad th	to (pa r-scottar)		

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all <a>

<

Does the General Manager communicate expectations of the board and utility clearly to employees?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all <a> <a>

https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1FcDeqTztM5oHTMjeHypYPTEiT2K4qpG3Luc6LGiuoyw/viewform

DRAFT

Does the General Manager identify current issues, problems, or projects that most concern the board?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all <a>O <a>O <a>O <a>O <a>o all of the time

Technical/Manaagerial

Does the General Manager understand and effectively direct the financial and business affairs of the utility?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager monitor and respond effectively to the changing human resources needs in the utility?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager delegate appropriately?

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🛞 🔘 💮 🛞 🔘 all of the time

Does the General Manager exercise fair-mindedness in dealing with employees, policies and procedures

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Other comments

		11%, n (7 a 19%, dag (7 7	Produces a desail of the	na na na na transfer	ha ben bit stillen die de	Performance Evaluation- General Manager	\mathbf{n}
						L)RA
			17	çe nevez Takteler		and the second	
Political S	kil	Is					
Does the Genera interests?	i Ma	inaç	jer (com	mur	icate effectively with the community and b	business
	A month	2	ŝ	4	S		
seldom or not at all	a	<i>6</i> 3	<i>ē</i> a	â	à	all of the time	
	ne ne en mere						
seldom or not at al	a y Ba y san y su 230	2 ©		and a start of the s		all of the time	
1971 - Andrew State		٢	Ø	0	Ø	all of the time	rging ne
Does the Genera		© ana(رچ ger :	0	© (to	nfluence government concerning the eme	rging ne
Does the Genera	🍥 Ma ? 1	© anag 2	ری ger: ع	© seel 4	© (to 5	nfluence government concerning the eme	rging neo
Does the Genera the organization	🍥 Ma ? 1	© anag 2	ری ger: ع	© seel 4	© (to 5	nfluence government concerning the eme	rging neo
Does the Genera the organization seldom or not at al Does the Genera	I @ I Ma ? 1 I @	© Annag 2 ©) ger: 3)	© seel 4 ©	© (to 5 ©	nfluence government concerning the eme	
Does the Genera the organization seldom or not at al Does the Genera	I @ I Ma ? 1 I @	© Annag 2 ©) ger: 3)	© seel 4 ©	© (to 5 ©	influence government concerning the eme all of the time	
Does the Genera the organization seldom or not at al Does the Genera community?	I 🔊 I Ma ? 1 🔘 I Ma 1	© ала(2 © ала) 2	ger: 3 © ger 3	© seel 4 © worl	(to) 5 6 6 6	influence government concerning the eme all of the time improve the image of the organization in t	
Does the Genera the organization seldom or not at al Does the Genera	I 🔊 I Ma ? 1 💮 I Ma 1	 المحمد المحمد المحم المحمد المحمد محمد محمد محمد محمد محمد محمد محمد) ger: 3 () ger 3	© seel 4 © worl	(to) 5 5	influence government concerning the eme all of the time improve the image of the organization in t	

2015	F	Performance Evaluation- General Manager
		DRAFI
	j je na vzenijela taka se u skala ne uzaklavana konstanta za konstanta za konstanta za konstanta konstanta konst na za konstanta konstanta konstan	na an a
	Goals and Priorities for	r Next Year
	identify goals and priorities for the ne	
	Employee may prepare separate narrative attachment" in box below.	to email to HR Chair or designee. Please add "see separate
	attachiment in box below.	
	- * - 	-
	ร โดยประเทศสายการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทการกระบาทกังกระบาท	100 the state the state of the
	unitaria adatus desaras y manana (EU () ().	
	Never submit passwords through Google	Forms 100%: You made it.
		roma.
	Pow ered by	This content is neither created nor endorsed by Google.
	r aw crod by	Report Abuse - Terms of Service - Additional Terms
		report Abuse - Terrib of Service - Auguoridi Terrib

Timestamp	Has the General Manager successfully managed the organization financially?	Does the General manager go beyond short-term financial operating performance- capturing longer-range targets as well?	Does the General Manager build a strong staff to support the organization's efforts?
3/11/2015 8:33:34	4	5	4
3/11/2015 15:01:52	6	5	5
3/11/2015 20:52:29		3	2



3 responses

View all responses

Summary

SAMPLE

Name

Citizen

David Price

Cynthia Ward



Has the General Manag	ger successfully mana	aged the organization financ	;ially?
-----------------------	-----------------------	------------------------------	---------

0	0%
0	0%
1	33%
1	33%
1	33%
	0 1 1

Does the General manager go beyond short-term financial operating performance- capturing longer-range targets as well?



1	0	0%
2	0	0%
3	1	33%
4	Ô	0%
5	2	67%

Does the General Manager build a strong staff to support the organization's efforts?

Performance Evaluation- General Manager - Google Forms



1	0	0%
2	1	33%
3	0	0%
4	1	33%
5	1	33%

SAMPLE

Does the General Manager perform competently regarding quality/quantity of work, planning/organizing, decision making, communication, public relations, interpersonal relations with co-workers, and supervision?



1	1	33%
2	Ũ	0%
3	0	0%
4	1	33%
5	1	33%

Does the General Manager promote a good working relationship with the Board of Commissioners?



1	1	33%
2	0	0%
3	0	0%
4	0	0%
5	2	67%

Accountability/Communications

Does the General Manager communicate openly and effectively with commissioners?





-	1	1	33%
	2	0	0%
	3	0	0%
	4	0	0%
	5	2	67%

SAMPLE

Does the General Manager provide useful information to the board that is helpful in board decision making?



1	0	0%
2	1	33%
3	0	0%
4	0	0%
5	2	67%

Does the General Manager openly respect and trust the board?



1	1	33%
2	0	0%
3	0	0%
4	0	0%
5	1	33%

Does the General Manager meet commitments made to the board?

Performance Evaluation-Internal Auditor					
Review Period: July 1, 2014 through June 30, 2015					
Audit Project Skills and Technical Knowledge					
Demonstrates good judgment, analytical ability, and uses common sense in making					

decisions.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🍥 🔘 all of the time

Plans and develops audit programs timely after completing preliminary survey/risk assessment.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🛞 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Identifies high risk areas and designs appropriate tests to achieve audit objectives.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Demonstrates workpaper documentation skills (e.g., well-documented, crossed-referenced, complete, and well-organized).

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all <a>

Identifies and references necessary research and analysis of BWL policies and procedures.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Demonstrates knowledge of professional auditing standards.

						Performance Eva
n manananan makan mananan sa saca wakan ca jara parta ara ar basa waka daga baga baga baga baga baga baga bag	1	2	3	4	5	n yangin 1931 1944, Maria Bay, Madri Janggana, manangana, s
eldom or not at al	0	0	0	٩	0	all of the time
Vaintains object	ivity	y in	per	forn	ning	audits,
, starter Fan Starter Denner som er kan med ander a			3	4	5	
seldom or not at al			0	0	0	all of the time
Follows-up to as	:ert	ain	tha	t ap	prop	orlate action v
	1	2	3	4	5	
seldom or not at all	0	0	0	0	0	all of the time
Communic Demonstrates wi minimal edits).	at: itte	n co	omn	nuni	cati	- -
Demonstrates wi	at: itte	n co	omn		cati	- -
Demonstrates wi	at itte	n co 2	omn 3	nuni 4	cati 5	on proficienc
Demonstrates wi minimal edits). seldom or not at all Produces reports	at itte 1	n co 2	3 ©	nuni 4	cati 5	on proficienc
Demonstrates wi minimal edits).	itte 1 ©	n cc 2 ©	omn 3 ©	nuni 4	cati 5 ©	on proficienc
Demonstrates wi minimal edits). seldom or not at all Produces reports information.	itte 1 ©	n cc 2 () nt ar 2	omn 3 © re fa 3	4 © actur 4	cati 5 © al,s	on proficienc all of the time upported by v
Demonstrates wi minimal edits). seldom or not at all Produces reports nformation.	itte 1 • tha 1 ©	n cc 2 (it ar 2 (it ar	omn 3 © re fa 3 ©	4 © actu 4 ©	cati 5 (i) al, s 5 (i)	on proficienc all of the time upported by v all of the time
Demonstrates wi minimal edits). seldom or not at all Produces reports	itte 1 • tha 1 • rbal 1	n cc 2 (it ar 2 (it ar 2 (it col 2	omn 3 © re fa 3 © mm 3	nuni 4 0 4 0 unic 4	cati 5 al, s 5 ©	on proficienc all of the time upported by v all of the time

Performance Evaluation-Internal Auditor

1 2 3 4 5	4 5	4	3	Ź	1
-----------	-----	---	---	---	---



seldom or not at all 🔘 💮 💮 💮 🍈 all of the time

is well organized, effectively prioritizes assignments, and minimizes "down time".

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🛞 💮 💮 💮 💮 all of the time

Follows directions and requires minimal supervision.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🛞 🔘 🛞 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Scope of Work

Reviews reliability and integrity of financial and operating information and the means used to identify, measure, classify, and report such information.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Reviews the systems established to ensure compliance with those policies, plans, procedures, laws and regulations, and contracts which could have a significant impact on operations and reports.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Reviews the means of safeguarding assets and as appropriate, verify the existence of such assets.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Career Development

Performance Evaluation-Internal Auditor

DRAFT

Made progress towards achieving previous year's goals/objectives

ţ.	2	3	4	5

seldom or not at all () () () () all of the time

Maintained technical competence through continuing education.

1 2 3 4 5

seldom or not at all 🔘 🛞 🔘 🔘 🔘 all of the time

Comments/Remarks

Employee Comments

Commissioner's Comments

Submit

Never submit passwords through Google Forms.

Pow ered by

This content is neither created nor endorsed by Google. Report Abuse - Terms of Service - Additional Terms